

MAY 06 2018

CM2

21 Roszel Road P.O. Box 5226 Princeton, NJ 08543-5226 609.924.0808 *main* | 609.452.1888 *fax*

www.hillwallack.com

Writer's Direct Dial: (609) 734-6311 rpeterson@hillwallack.com

May 4, 2016

RECEIVED

VIA NEW JERSEY LAWYERS SERVICE

State of New Jersey Attorney General's Office, Dept. of Law and Public Safety PO Box 080 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0080

MAY 06 2016

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES
MAIL ROOM

Re: In the Matter of the Petition of Time Warner Cable, Inc., Charter Communications, Inc. and Time Warner Cable New York City LLC, for Approval of the Transfer of Control of Time Warner Cable New York City, LLC and Approval of Transaction Financing

Docket No. CM15070770

In the Matter of the Verified Petition of Charter Communications, Inc. and Time Warner Cable Inc., for Approval of the Transfer of Control of Time Warner Cable Information Services (New Jersey), LLC and Approval of Transaction Financing Docket No. TM15070772

Dear Sir/Madam:

This office represents the National Association of African American-Owned Media ("NAAAOM"), and Entertainment Studios, Inc. ("ESI"). Enclosed herewith please find an application for permission to file an emergent motion, which was filed with the Appellate Division on May 4, 2016. An application for a stay was also filed with the Board of Public Utilities on May 4, 2016.

Thank you for your attention in this regard.

Very truly yours,

WALLACK LLP

Rocký L. Peterson, Esq.

RLP:amo

{F:/wdox/docs/018918/00001/04607969; 1}

Princeton, NJ I Morristown, NJ I Yardley, PA

Case mont C. Vachini Caldo-

Enclosures

ce: New Jersey Board of Public Utilities w/encl.

(VIA NEW JERSEY LAWYERS SERVICE)

Stephani A. Brand, Esq. w/encl.

(VIA NEW JERSEY LAWYERS SERVICE)

Dennis C. Linken, Esq. w/encl.

(VIA NEW JERSEY LAWYERS SERVICE)

Superior Court of New Jersey Appellate Division Application for Permission to File Emergent Motion

To: Appellate Division Emergent Judge	Date: 5/4/2016		
From: Rocky L. Peterson	Telephone: (609) 734-6311		

The following questions are to be answered by the attorney or self-represented litigant requesting permission to file an emergent motion. This questionnaire is designed to assist the court's determination respecting its further instructions. COMPLETION OF THIS APPLICATION DOES NOT IN ANY SENSE CONSTITUTE THE FILING OF AN APPEAL OR MOTION. There is no right to be heard orally on an emergency application. Further instructions will come from the court.

Except by permission of the court, the only documents you may submit with this application are: a copy of the decision being appealed, any opinion or statement of reasons given by the trial judge or agency, and any order or decision denying or granting a stay. A copy of this application must be served simultaneously on both your adversary and the trial judge or agency. No answer shall be filed unless directed by the court.

If the court grants you permission to file an emergent motion and you have not previously filed a motion for leave to appeal or notice of appeal (whichever is applicable), you must simultaneously file one. See njcourts.com for notice of appeal and Court Rules. You must also pay the applicable filing fee (\$50 for a motion for leave to appeal; \$250 for a notice of appeal), direct the charging of an attorney's account with the Superior Court, or file a motion to proceed as an indigent and supporting certification.

Case Name: In the Matter of the Petition of Time Warner Cable, Inc., et al.	
Appellate Division Docket Number: (if available):	•
Trial Court or Agency Docket Number: TM15070772; CM15070770	

1. What is the vicinage of the matter? (i.e., what judge, in what county or what agency entered the decision?)

Board of Public Utilities

- a) What is your name, address, including any e-mail address, phone number and fax number?
 Rocky L. Peterson; 21 Roszel Road, Princeton, NJ 08540; rpeterson@hillwallack.com; (609) 734-6311; (609) 452-1888.
 - b) Who do you represent? (i.e., client, yourself)
 National Association of African American-Owned Media ("NAAAOM") and Entertainment Studios, Inc. ("ESI").

- 3. List the names of all other parties and name, address, including any known e-mail address, phone number and fax number of attorney for each.
 - 1. Stefanie Brand; Division of Rate Counsel, 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor, Trenton NJ 08625; (609)-984-1460 (p); (609)-292-2923 (f)
 - 2. Dennis C. Linken, Esq.; Scarinci & Hollenbeck LLC; 1100 Valley Brook Avenue, Lyndhurst NJ 07071; dlinken@sh-law.com; (201)-806-3426 (p); (201)-806-3454 (f).
- 4. What is the nature of the emergency?

The BPU approved a merger between Time Warner Cable, Inc. and Charter Communications, Inc. which has a discriminatory impact upon minority-owned media companies. Once this merger is consummated, this case will become moot and this Court will be incapable of granting relief. The BPU must be required to re-open this matter so that NAAAOM and ESI may present evidence of the impact of this merger.

5. What is the irreparable harm, and when do you expect this harm to occur?

Without a stay of the decision of the Board of Public Utilities, Charter Communications and Time Warner Cable will begin to take steps to consummate their merger, and the BPU may not be able to undo the merger without exorbitant cost and burden on all parties involved. Once this merger occurs, minority-owned media will inevitably be shutout from participation in the marketplace, as Charter Communications has a pattern and practice of being unwilling to do business with minority-owned media companies.

6. What relief do you seek?

A stay of the decision of the Board of Public Utilities and for the Board to hold a public hearing so that evidence of the discriminatory impact of this merger may be presented.

- 7. Do you have a written order or judgment entered by the trial judge or a written agency decision? You must attach a copy of the order, judgment or decision.

 See the attached.
- 8. a) Have you filed for a stay before the trial court or agency?

A letter was sent to the Division of Rate Counsel on April 27, 2016, but no response has yet been received. An application for a stay was sent to the BPU on May 4, 2016. The Attorney General's Office has also been sent a copy of this application for emergent relief.

b) If so, do you have a court order or agency decision denying or granting same?

Attach a copy of any such order or decision. Before you seek a stay from the Appellate

Division, you must first apply to the trial court or agency for a stay and obtain a signed order
or decision or other evidence of the ruling on your stay application. (Court Rules 2:9-5 and
2:9-7)

No.

9.	If you did not immediately seek a stay from the trial court or agency, or if you did not immediately file this application with the Appellate Division after the trial court or agency denied your stay application, explain the reasons for the delay.
10.	Are there any claims against any party below, either in this or a consolidated action, which have not been disposed of, including counterclaims, cross-claims, third-party claims and applications for counsel fees? If so, the decision is not final, but rather interlocutory, and leave to appeal must be sought. (Court Rules 2:2-4 and 2:5-6)
11.	If the order or agency decision is interlocutory (i.e., not final), are you filing a motion for leave to appeal?
12.	If interlocutory, are you filing a motion to stay the trial court or agency proceeding?
13.	If the order, judgment or agency decision is final, have you filed a notice of appeal? Yes.
14.	What is the essence of the order, judgment or agency decision? The agency decision has approved of the merger between Time Warner and Charter, finding that positive benefits would flow to customers and that the transaction was in accordance with law, in the public interest, had a likelihood of creating positive benefits, and that there would be no adverse impact on the financial integrity of the affected New Jersey companies.

ι	Appellate Division by emergent application or prior appeal proceedings? If so, which judge or part?
•	N/A
	b) Have the merits briefs been filed in this matter? If so, has the matter been calendared to a part of the Appellate Division? N/A
16.	 a) Have you served simultaneously a copy of this application on both your adversary and the trial judge or agency? Yes
	b) If so, specify method of service. New Jersey Lawyers' Service.
17.	a) Have any transcripts been ordered (particularly of the trial judge's challenged ruling)? N/A
	b) If so, when will the transcript(s) be available? N/A

18. Please give a brief summary of the facts of your case.

By way of a Petition dated July 2, 2015 and filed on July 7, 2015, Charter Communications, Inc. ("Charter"), Time Warner Cable, Inc. ("TWC") and Time Warner Cable New York City, LLC ("TWCNYC") initiated a proceeding before the Board of Public Utilities seeking approval for Charter to acquire control of TWCNYC. Charter, TWC, and Time Warner Cable Information Services (New Jersey), LLC filed a separate verified Petition requesting approval of the proposed transfer of control of TWCIS, an indirect subsidiary of TWC, to a subsidiary of Charter, CCHI, LLC. In both matters, Charter, TWC, TWCNYC, and TWCIS (collectively referred to as the "Petitioners") also requested from the Board for approval for financing related to the proposed transfers of control.

Despite knowledge of the continuation of institutionalized racism from Charter - one of the nation's largest media companies - the BPU has approved the transaction without investigating or holding a public hearing. The BPU's action totally disregarded the valid concerns raised by NAAAOM and ESI regarding this continuing practice of discrimination in contracting for television channel carriage. Charter has a record of refusing to do business with 100% African American-owned media companies, and its proposed merger with Time Warner Cable will neither promote diversity nor be in the public interest, and will facilitate racial discrimination in contracting in violation of law.

19. What legal citation (i.e., statute, regulation, court case) is most important for the proposition that you are likely to prevail on appeal?

In approving the transfer of control of Time Warner Cable to Charter, without addressing Charter's discriminatory conduct and its impact on a large portion of American society, the BPU has violated, and continues to violate, ESI's equal protection rights under the United States Constitution, the anti-discrimination provisions of the New Jersey Constitution, N.J. Const. art. I, §§1 and 5, and the New Jersey Law Against Discrimination, N.J.S.A. 10:5-4, 12. The BPU, like all state governmental entities in New Jersey, has an affirmative obligation to enforce these anti-discrimination laws and to assure that its own actions do not foster racial discrimination. See, e.g., Sellers v. Philip's Barber Shop, 46 N.J. 340, 347(1966) (Board of Barber Examiners); In re Township of Warren, 132 N.J. 1, 25 (1993) (Council on Affordable Housing.) The BPU actions facilitate Charter's continuing racial discrimination in contracting in violation of 42 U.S.C. § 1981.

to harass or to cause unnecessary delay	or expense. I further certify that the factual statements contained in this
application are true to the best of my kn	nowledge
Date: MM 4 2016	(Rochen Vestenson)
	Frint/Type Name of Attorney or Self-Represented Litigant
	Signature of Attorney or Self-Represented Litigant

By signing below, I certify that this application is made in good faith, and not for any improper purpose such as

Superior Court of New Jersey Appellate Division

Disposition on Application for Permission to File Emergent Motion

Ca	se Na	me: In the Matter of the Petition of Time Warner Cable, Inc., et al.				
Aŗ	pellat	e Division Docket Number: (if available):				
Tr	ial Co	urt or Agency Below: Board of Public Utilities				
Tr	ial Co	urt or Agency Docket Number: TM15070772; CM15070770				
		DO NOT FILL IN THIS SECTION – FOR COURT USE ONLY				
I.	I. The application for leave to file an emergent motion on short notice is Denied for the following reasons					
	The application on its face does not concern a threat of irreparable injury, or a situation in which the interests of justice otherwise require adjudication on short notice. The applicant may file a motion with Clerk's Office in the ordinary course.					
	The threatened harm or event is not scheduled to occur prior to the time in which a motion could be filed the Clerk's Office and decided by the court. If the applicant promptly files a motion with the Clerk's Office it shall be forwarded to a Panel for decision as soon as the opposition is filed.					
	The applicant did not apply to the trial court or agency for a stay, and obtain a signed court order, agency decision or other evidence of the ruling before seeking a stay from the Appellate Division.					
	The application concerns an order entered during trial or on the eve of trial as to which there is no prima facie showing that the proposed motion would satisfy the standards for granting leave to appeal.					
	The timing of the application suggests that the emergency is self-generated, given that no good explanat has been offered for the delay in seeking appellate relief. Due to the delay, we cannot consider a short-notice motion within the time frame the applicant seeks, without depriving the other party of a reasonab time to submit opposition. And the magnitude of the threatened harm does not otherwise warrant adjudicating this matter on short notice despite the delay. If the applicant promptly files a motion with the Clerk's Office it shall be forwarded to a Panel for decision as soon as the opposition is filed.					
		Other reasons:				
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
_		J.A.D. Date				

Superior Court of New Jersey Appellate Division

Disposition on Application for Permission to File Emergent Motion

Ca	se Nam	ne: In the Matter	r of the Petition of T	Time Warner Cable,	Inc., et al.		
Αp	pellate	Division Dock	tet Number: (if ava	ailable):		***************************************	
Tri	al Cou	rt or Agency B	elow: Board of Pub	blic Utilities		~~~	
Tri	al Cou	rt or Agency D	ocket Number: Ti	M15070772; CM150	70770		
		DO NO	T FILL IN TI	HIS SECTION	- FOR CO	URT USE ON	LY
II.	The a	pplication for le	eave to file an emer	rgent motion on sho	ort notice is Gr	anted on the follo	owing terms:
A.	this is	a newly-filed a	ppeal, one copy eac	, one cop and e sent to the trial ju ch of the notice of a d to the judges and	appeal or motio	n for leave to app	
	Appel chambapplic originamotion chambato file any sta	late Division in pers,	Trenton, by no late at same schedule, first of a notice of appear indigent. [Note: ersaries, but they may so Office or to subm	it the required fees	r those papers a is not yet pendion office, attention ave to appeal, to cipates that copailed or hand do may result in office.	are due to the judging in the Appella on Emergent Applogether with the roies may be faxed elivered to the Clelismissal of the apploach in the apploach of the apploach in the apploach is the apploach in the apploach in the apploach in the apploach is the apploach in the apploach in the apploach in the apploach is the apploach in the	ges' te Division, the ications Unit, the equired fees or a
В.	Oppos	sition must be se	erved and filed by i	no later than		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
C.	Other	terms:					
		<u> </u>					
	-						·
					 		
							,
	• •				,		
•							
				,			·
	-				·		
,			<u> </u>	A. A. A. A.			
			•	J.A.D.	,		Date