Eric Miller Natural Resources Defense Council 40 W 20<sup>th</sup> St. #11 New York, NY 10011 973-495-0263 emiller@nrdc.org

Attorney for Movant, Natural Resources Defense Council

IN THE MATTER OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY- APPROVAL OF ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS AND THE ASSOCIATED COST RECOVERY MECHANISM PURSUANT TO THE CLEAN ENERGY ACT, N.J.S.A 48:3-87.8 et seq. and 48:3-98.1 et seq. STATE OF NEW JERSEY BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

OFFICE OF CLEAN ENERGY

Commissioner Chivukula

BPU DOCKET NO. EO20090622

# MOTION FOR INTERVENTION BY NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL

The Natural Resources Defense Council ("NRDC"), seeks leave under New Jersey Administrative Code ("N.J.A.C.") 1:1-16.1 *et seq.*, to intervene in the above captioned proceeding before the Board of Public Utilities ("BPU"), wherein New Jersey Natural Gas Company ("NJNG") seeks BPU approval of a three year energy efficiency program.

# **BACKGROUND**

- A. NRDC's Interest in This Matter and Experience with BPU Proceedings
- 1. NRDC is a global nonprofit membership organization that combines the power of more than three million members and online activists with the expertise of some 500 scientists, lawyers,

- and policy advocates across the globe to ensure the rights of all people to the air, the water, and the wild. NRDC has more than 410,000 dues-paying members globally, including more than 12,000 in New Jersey and many in NJNG's New Jersey service territory.
- 2. As discussed further below, NRDC and its members are, specifically and directly affected by the outcome of this case concerning NJNG's proposed Energy Efficiency Program, because NRDC itself has long-standing initiatives—on behalf of its members, locally in New Jersey and across the country—to promote cost-effective energy efficiency programs implemented by regulated electric and gas utilities.
- 3. If allowed to intervene, NRDC will provide expert testimony and other evidence to ensure that the NJNG EE Program would promote the successful implement of energy efficiency programs and measures, ultimately, the interests of the public, including its members.

# NRDC's Expertise in Energy Efficiency

- 4. NRDC has extensive expertise and experience in engaging state utility commissions as they structure statewide programs and policies, and evaluate utility-specific proposals, regarding energy efficiency, cost recovery, distribution planning, and related utility functions
- 5. With respect to energy efficiency programs, NRDC has participated in matters across the country, including California, Colorado, Illinois, Michigan, Missouri, Montana, New York, New Jersey, New Mexico North Carolina, Ohio, Pennsylvania, and Washington.
- 6. Thus, NRDC, if allowed to intervene, would draw on its relevant experience and expertise to help evaluate the NJNG energy efficiency program and, specifically, its ability to meet the

requirements of New Jersey energy efficiency targets and policy priorities.

# LEGAL GROUNDS FOR INTERVENTION

- 15. Under New Jersey law, any person or entity "who will be substantially, specifically, and directly affected by the outcome of a contested case" may seek leave to intervene and become a party to an administrative case such as this case.<sup>1</sup>
- 16. When ruling on a motion to intervene, the presiding officer shall take into consideration the following factors: (1) the nature and extent of the moving party's interest in the outcome of the case; (2) whether that interest is sufficiently different from that of any other party so as to add measurably and constructively to the scope of the case, (3) the prospect for confusion or undue delay arising from including of the party, and (4) other appropriate matters.<sup>2</sup>

### **ARGUMENT**

NRDC will be Substantially, Specifically, and Directly Affected by the Outcome of this Case.

17. Fundamentally, NJNG seeks ratepayer dollars to fund its proposed Energy Efficiency Program. Therefore, the outcome of this case will substantially, specifically, and directly affect NRDC's members who are NJNG customers, because these members will bear approved program costs that could add up to millions of dollars. NRDC has more than 12,000 members in New Jersey, including NJNG's service territory, and its material interest in ensuring that the proposed investments reduce energy usage and are cost-effective, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> N.J.A.C. 1:1-16.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> N.J.A.C. 1:1-16.3(a).

- that the NJNG energy efficiency program, specifically, operates effectively to reduce energy usage, decrease customer bills, and decrease the emission of harmful climate pollutants from the building sector, and by extension, the power sector.
- 18. The outcome of this case: (1) has significant implications for the provision of utility service and the functioning of the gas distribution system as it relates to safety, modernization, and economic welfare, and equity, and (2) goes to the heart of NRDC's mission with regard to ensuring optimal planning and support for clean energy technologies and programs. These issues are of the utmost importance to NRDC and its members, including those in New Jersey.
- 19. The NJNG Petition, if structured to maximize the full range of environmental and consumer benefits, will further NRDC's mission by implementing energy efficiency programs in an optimal manner.

NRDC's Interest is Sufficiently Different from Any Other Party so as to Add Measurably and Constructively to the Case.

20. NRDC's unique expertise will measurably and constructively advance this proceeding in accordance with N.J.A.C. 1:1-16.3(a). In its filing, NJNG proposes energy efficiency measures that reduce gas usage, can reduce customer bills, increase home comfort for customers, and advance the goals for the Clean Energy Act. NRDC will add substantive value to this proceeding by bringing to bear its unique expertise and analyses on nationwide energy efficiency programs and extensive experience with a wide range of energy efficiency-

- related utility policies, such as cost recovery, thus enabling a full development of the record.
- 21. Expertise and Analysis. NRDC will review and analyze NJNG's petition, proposal, and filings. Drawing on its expertise and experience NRDC will provide solutions and recommendations to improve Program effectiveness while minimizing costs to ratepayers. NRDC additionally plans to review and comment on comments, proposals, and other information brought throughout the course of this proceeding to help ensure that customer, safety, cost, and environmental implications of the NJNG Petition are optimized. This contemplated analysis will help assure that the NJNG Petition and Energy Efficiency Program achieves the greatest result possible.
- 22. <u>Full Development of the Record.</u> NRDC's intervention can assist with the development of a full record, through testimony, cross-examination, and briefing, in areas where other intervenors do not share NRDC's particular expertise. If NRDC is not permitted to intervene in this instant proceeding, evidence that they intend to present regarding vital ways to improve the NJNG Petition for greater consumer and environmental benefits will not be available. In addition, receiving a different status would deny Movants access to the discovery process, which would preclude them from further developing and refining its position and arguments as the proceeding progresses, in a manner that is maximally beneficial for proceeding as a whole.

Intervention by NRDC will not Cause Confusion or Result in Undue Delay.

23. NRDC will work with other parties to ensure that they avoid duplicating efforts and so as to

prevent confusion and undue delay. In addition, NRDC will strictly abide by the schedule and other rulings made herein.

# **CONCLUSION**

NRDC has met the criteria for intervention in the NJNG Petition and respectfully requests that an Order be issued granting them intervenor status.

DATED: October 2, 2018

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Eric Miller

Eric Miller, Esq.
Id# 161452016
Natural Resources Defense Council
40 W 20<sup>th</sup> St. #11
New York, NY 10011
Phone 973.495.0263
emiller@nrdc.org

# **CERTIFICATION OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this day served by electronic mail a copy of the foregoing Motion for Intervention on all parties who have entered an appearance or are otherwise entitled to service in this proceeding.

Dated this 2nd day of October 2020.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Eric Miller

Eric Miller, Esq.
Id# 161452016
Natural Resources Defense Council
40 W 20<sup>th</sup> St. #11
New York, NY 10011
Phone 973.495.0263
emiller@nrdc.org

#### Service List

#### **BPU**

Aida Camacho-Welch Secretary of the Board Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 aida.camacho@bpu.nj.gov board.secretary@bpu.nj.gov

Paul Flanagan, Esquire Executive Director paul.flanagan@bpu.state.nj.us

Robert Brabston, Esquire Deputy Executive Director robert.brabston@bpu.nj.gov

Christine Guhl Sadovy Chief of Staff christine.sadovy@bpu.nj.gov

Benjamin Witherell, Ph.D. Chief Economist benjamin.witherell@bpu.nj.gov

### **Division of Clean Energy**

Kelly Mooij Director kelly.mooij@bpu.nj.gov

Sherri Jones Assistant Director sherri.jones@bpu.nj.gov

Benjamin S. Hunter Manager Bureau of Clean & Renewable Energy benjamin.hunter@bpu.nj.gov

Mahogany A. Hall Program Specialist 2 mahogany.hall@bpu.nj.gov

Benjamin Goldstein Program Specialist benjamin.goldstein@bpu.nj.gov

# **Division of Energy**

Stacy Peterson
Director, Division of Energy
stacy.peterson@bpu.nj.gov

Paul Lupo Bureau Chief, Rates & Tariffs paul.lupo@bpu.nj.gov Bart Kilar bart.kilar@bpu.nj.gov

#### Counsel's Office

Abraham Silverman, Esquire Chief Counsel abe.silverman@bpu.nj.gov

Carol Artale, Esquire Deputy Chief Counsel carol.artale@bpu.nj.gov

Suzanne Patnaude, Esquire Senior Counsel suzanne.patnaude@bpu.nj.gov

Rachel Boylan, Esquire rachel.boylan@bpu.nj.gov

Charles Gurkas Paralegal charles.gurkas@bpu.nj.gov

#### DAG

Pamela L. Owen, Esquire Deputy Attorney General Hughes Justice Complex 25 Market Street P.O. Box 112 Trenton, NJ 08625 pamela.owen@law.njoag.gov

Brandon C. Simmons, Esquire Deputy Attorney General brandon.simmons@law.njoag.gov

### RATE COUNSEL

Stefanie A. Brand, Esquire Director Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003 sbrand@rpa.nj.gov

Brian O. Lipman, Esquire Litigation Manager blipman@rpa.nj.gov

Ami Morita, Esquire Managing Attorney – Electric amorita@rpa.nj.gov

Felicia Thomas-Friel, Esquire Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel <a href="mailto:fthomas@rpa.nj.gov">fthomas@rpa.nj.gov</a> Kurt Lewandowski, Esquire Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel klewando@rpa.nj.gov

Sarah H. Steindel, Esquire Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel <a href="mailto:ssteinde@rpa.nj.gov">ssteinde@rpa.nj.gov</a>

Maura Caroselli, Esquire Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel mcaroselli@rpa.nj.gov

Shelly Massey smassey@rpa.nj.gov

### **NJNG**

Mark G. Kahrer,
Vice President Regulatory Affairs
mkahrer@njng.com
Andrew K. Dembia
Regulatory Affairs Counsel
adembia@njng.com